Hiring Decision Rubric

A six-step debrief and decision process that replaces gut-feel discussion with a sequence, scored on the same 1 to 3 scale as the interview scorecard.

This picks up where the scorecard leaves off. Everyone has interviewed, everyone has had their few minutes afterward to write their own notes, and nobody has compared anything yet. What follows is six steps, in order.

The debrief is where good interviews go to die. Whoever speaks first anchors the room, the most senior voice carries more weight than it should, and the conversation drifts toward whoever was most likeable. The order below exists to slow that down. Use it for every finalist, including the obvious ones, which are where anchoring does the most damage.

Step 1. Everyone submits before anyone talks

Once you have finished your interview and had your two minutes to write your own notes, submit the scorecard. Then stop. No corridor conversations, no "what did you think?" in the lift.

- Every interviewer has submitted a scorecard with five scores
- Nobody has discussed the candidate with anyone else
- One person has collated the scores into the grid in step 2
- The job scorecard is on the table, with its ranked behaviors

If someone hasn't submitted, move the debrief. Running it without them means their scores get formed in the room, by the discussion, which is the thing this process exists to prevent.

Step 2. Collate the scores

One row per behavior, in the rank order from the job scorecard. One column per interviewer. Scores are the 1 to 3 from the scorecard. Fill this in before anyone speaks.

BEHAVIOR (RANKED)	INT. 1	INT. 2	INT. 3	SPREAD
1.				
2.				
3.				
4.				
5.				

Spread is the gap between the highest and lowest score on that row. On a three-point scale, a spread of 2 means one interviewer saw a clear example and another saw none at all. That is the most useful thing in the grid, and step 3 spends its time there.

Interviewing.com Free to use and share.

Step 3. Run the debrief

1. **Read the grid in silence.** Two minutes. No discussion.
2. **Most junior interviewer speaks first.** The hiring manager goes last, every time.
3. **Work down the behaviors in rank order**, not interviewer by interviewer. Behavior 1 gets the most time.
4. **On any row with a spread of 2**, each person reads out their one line of evidence. Not their impression, the line they wrote. Usually one of them asked a follow-up the other didn't, and the disagreement dissolves in thirty seconds.
5. **Name the blanks.** Which behaviors did nobody get a usable answer on?
6. **Then apply step 4.** Not before.

Step 4. Apply the decision rule

Agree this wording before you start interviewing, not now. Written afterward, it bends toward whoever you already like.

WHAT THE GRID SHOWS	OUTCOME
Behaviors 1 and 2 scored 3, nothing scored 1	Offer
Behaviors 1 and 2 scored 3, a 2 further down the list	Offer, with that gap named in the first 90 days
Either of the top two behaviors scored 2	Not yet. One more conversation aimed at that behavior
Any behavior scored 1	No
Either of the top two left at n/a by everyone	Not a decision yet. Go and get the evidence

The two "not yet" rows are the ones people skip. "We liked them, we'll find out on the job" is how most mis-hires get made. A second 30-minute conversation is cheap next to a hire that unwinds in month seven.

If you find yourself arguing that a rule shouldn't apply to this candidate, that is worth noticing. It is usually the moment the process stops working.

Step 5. Record the decision

Decision	Offer / No / More evidence needed
The scores it rests on	
What we are still uncertain about	
If this turns out wrong, it will be because	
Decided by	
Date	

That fourth row takes ten seconds and is the most valuable line in the document. Read it again in six months. It is the fastest way to learn whether your job scorecard describes the role or only your hopes for it.

Step 6. Hand the gaps to onboarding

Every behavior that scored 2, and every row you marked "not yet" and then resolved, is the new hire's first 90 days. Pass them to whoever runs onboarding on the day the offer is accepted, while the reasoning is still fresh and the scorecards are still open.

A gap you identified in hiring and forgot by week one is a gap you paid to discover and then threw away.